From: Jodi Aschim <jodi0406@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, November 29, 2023 6:26 PM

To: Kyle Holland **Subject:** Variance for lights

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from jodi0406@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Kyle,

My name is Jodi Aschim and I would like to voice my support for the variance at Carroll College. I understand there is some vocal opposition but I would like to voice some positivity regarding the project.

We live at 91 Oakwood Lane. We are very close to Batch fields. During the spring and summer months the lights at Batch Fields are not bothersome. I don't notice their height everyday when I drive by. What I notice and love is the "life" of Helena. The lights and cheering and traffic at Batch Fields is proof of that.

Carroll College is a pillar in this community. Like the Cathedral, and the Capital. They are all part of what makes Helena special. The stadium needs this upgrade. It is only going to make Carroll better, and thus the "life" and community better.

Thank you for your time, Jodi Aschim 91 Oakwood Lane Helena

From:Justin Elkins <jelkins888@outlook.com> **Sent:**Wednesday, November 29, 2023 5:14 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Carroll College Variance 11-4-2

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from jelkins888@outlook.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello,

I am a resident in Sunhaven and would like to voice my concerns over the reference Variance, Please do not approve the Variance as it will have drastic impact to me and my neighbors. We already have light pollution from the existing lights at Carroll and Centennial park.

Thank you for your time and consideration in this manor.

Justin Elkins

From: Kathy van Hook <kathyvanhook@yahoo.com>

Sent: Friday, December 1, 2023 11:14 AM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Variance to light height at Carroll College

[You don't often get email from kathyvanhook@yahoo.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I live across the street from Carroll College and am concerned about the possible increase in code governing the height of lights at Carroll. I live in the first block off Benton on Waukesha and the lighting in the new athletic building is intrusive to my residence. Carroll staff have made an effort to reduce the worst of the LED glare and are generally good neighbors but another increase in height and possible intensity of night lighting concerns me. I will attempt to attend the 12/5 Board of Adjustments but want to request more details about this Variance before the meeting. Please respond soon. You can also reach me at 406 439-4199. Thank you.

Kathy van Hook

Sent from my iPad

From: Lauren <aengran20@naver.com>
Sent: Thursday, November 30, 2023 6:43 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Opposition to Installation of 110' Light Poles at Athletic Stadium

Importance: High

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from aengran20@naver.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mr. Holland,

I hope this message finds you well. I am writing to express my strong opposition to the proposed installation of 110' light poles at the athletic stadium of [School's Name]. As a concerned member of the community, I believe this project raises significant issues that need careful consideration.

- 1. **Height and Visual Impact:** These poles, being the second tallest structures on campus, are comparable to 8 or 9 story buildings. Their sheer height will undoubtedly alter the visual landscape of our community, affecting views from every direction. This impact on the aesthetic appeal of the area should not be underestimated.
- 2. **Need and Necessity:** From my perspective, there seems to be a lack of necessity for such tall light poles. The potential benefits do not appear to outweigh the visual and environmental costs associated with this project. I would appreciate a more detailed explanation of why these specific poles are required for evening events.
- 3. **Community Concerns:** As part of the community, I am not convinced that the majority of residents support or even deem necessary the installation of these towering structures. A more comprehensive community engagement process might shed light on the broader sentiment regarding this proposal.

I kindly request that you consider these concerns seriously before moving forward with the installation of the light poles. Preserving the visual harmony of our community and ensuring that decisions align with the majority's interests are crucial aspects of responsible governance.

Thank you for your time and attention to this matter. I look forward to your response.

Sincerely, Lauren Jung 930 Hudson St. Helena MT 59601

From: Steve . <steve.b9411@outlook.com>
Sent: Thursday, November 30, 2023 10:33 AM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: proposed variance from Sec 11-4-2, N Benton

You don't often get email from steve.b9411@outlook.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

NO. Helena does not need more light pollution. Consider also downstream issues. Traffic congestion; parking; etc. Already, for their events, the college provides no provide traffic control. Their parking is insufficient to accommodate the vehicular traffic. Spill-over into the neighborhoods adjacent to and north of the college is horrendous. So let's make it worse? Perhaps the college aught better spend their money by expanding onsite event/site parking as provided done by most similar venues. Night games at Carroll? Really?

Sincerely, Steve Barta

From: Wesley Bruski <wbruski12@gmail.com> **Sent:** Wednesday, November 29, 2023 5:23 PM

To:Kyle HollandSubject:New Lights

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from wbruski12@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I would vote NO on the lights.

Thanks



Is your question or comment about a specific project?

Community Development Questions and Comments

• Yes			
O No			
Which project do you have a question	or comment about?		
Other			
First Name	Last Name		
Alicia	Pichette		
Email			
aliciapichette@yahoo.com			
Street Address			
301 N Park Ave #1E			
City	State	Zip Code	
Helena	Montana	59601	
Phone	Date		
4064312042			
This form is intended to help you eith	er get answers or submit a comment abo	ut work done through the	

This form is intended to help you either get answers or submit a comment about work done through the Community Development Department, including about a specific project being considered by City staff. Please select if you are asking a question or submitting a comment, and then, using the block below, submit your question or comment. A Community Development Department representative will contact you if appropriate. If your question or comment will not fit in the text box, please feel free to upload an additional document.

<u>Please be advised that your comments may be regarding an application not yet deemed complete or sufficient by City staff. Please revist the project website for updated information periodically and provide additional comments in the future, where necessary.</u>

Find the list of current projects here: https://www.helenamt.gov/government/departments/community-development/current-projects

Public Question or Comment
Question
✓ Comment
Question/Comment
Please oppose the variance request from Carroll College to add larger, brighter lighting at the stadium on the campus.
The campus is in the middle of a residential neighborhood. The additional height and brightness will adversely impact quality of life and property values in those neighborhoods. Northwestern Energy is replacing street lights all over the downtown area to preserve dark sky viewing, adding those proposed lights at Carroll is counterintuitive to the dark sky ordinances in place in other Montana cities and hoped for here in Helena. Please oppose this variance request.
Upload Additional Questions or Comments
If appropriate, someone may contact you. Would you like to be contacted by a City representative?
Yes
O No
If yes, what is your preferred method of contact?
✓ Email
Phone
Signature
App

From: Barbara Barnes
bbarneshelena@gmail.com>

Sent: Sunday, December 3, 2023 12:15 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Lighting Variance Request by Carrol College

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from bbarneshelena@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Ms. Holland,

Please count my input on this variance in the "no" column. We struggle enough to have skies that are friendly to migratory birds and this is not a welcome addition to the Helena I enjoy. Thank you for your hard work and commitment to your job as a planner.

Warmly, Barbara

Barbara Barnes

"Courage is what it takes to stand up and speak; courage is also what it takes to sit down and listen" Winston Churchill

<u>Transformative</u> Conflict Resolution and Prevention Facilitation, Organizational Systems Design Facilitation & Consulting, Mediation, Reflective Structured Dialogue, Inclusion & Equity Values Best Practices, Trauma Aware Best Practices, Restorative Justice, Conflict Coaching, End-of-Life Mediation, Mindfulness Instructor



braveconversationsllc.com

406-410-1444

Confidentiality Note: This communication, along with any attachments, is covered by Federal and State law governing electronic communications and may contain confidential and legally privileged information. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, you are notified that the dissemination, distribution, use or copying of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this in error, please reply immediately to the sender and delete this message. Thank you. This message and any attachments are for the designated recipient only and may contain privilege, proprietary, or otherwise private information. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender immediately and delete the original. Any other use of the email by you is prohibited.

From: Barry Hood <barryhood410@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 8:29 AM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Light variance for Carroll college stadium

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from barryhood410@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Please do not allow the college to build taller light poles for their stadium!! It will adversely affect our entire community. Thank you for your thoughtful consideration.

Barry Hood 410 S. Davis st. Helena

From: Arthur Howell <abhowell8@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 1:47 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: 110 ft light poles at Carroll College

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from abhowell8@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mr Holland,

We are writing in regard to the proposal to install 110 foot light poles on the property at Carroll College. We live in the Sunhaven subdivision close to the college. If these poles are installed we can only imagine the view we would have when we look out our windows to see the beautiful Montana skyline and have it obliterated by a bunch of light poles or lights. We have no idea WHY Carroll would need more light poles of any kind let alone this size. And when they are lit up at night no kind of blinds or curtains would keep the light from coming right into our bedroom windows. The trains no longer blare their horns in order to have a calmer effect on our community which is nice. Less light in our community has the same calmer quiet effect on residents. Please do not let these light poles be installed in any area of our town. Thank You.

Bonnie and Arthur Howel 125 Fairway Drive Helena MT 59601

abhowell8@gmail.com

From: Carol Culham <cjclum24@hotmail.com>
Sent: Monday, December 4, 2023 1:22 PM

To: Kyle Holland no to more lights

You don't often get email from cjclum24@hotmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I am opposed to higher and more lights at Carroll College. The HAC was about my limit on so many bright lights. They shine in my window all night long and serve no purpose. Where will the "more lighting end" for this institution?

Thanks for letting my opinion be known.

Carol Culham 504 Peosta Ave 406-410-4076

From: Christy Curd <christyc425@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, December 3, 2023 6:34 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: No on Carroll's Proposed Variance

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from christyc425@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello,

There are myriad reasons why 110' light poles on the Carroll Campus are inappropriate for Helena and its residents. Views, light pollution, lack of parking for the prospective nighttime events, and lack of need (Carroll is the highest-ranked Frontier Conference football team in NAIA rankings, for example) are just a few of these.

The abysmal public outreach about this literally gigantic potential change is perhaps the most concerning- Carroll knows what it's doing is not going to sit well with residents, so they seem to be trying to do it as quietly as possible.

Purely in the interest of good governance, The City should not approve the proposed variance.

Thanks

Christy Curd

From: Concetta Eckel <concettaeckel@charter.net>

Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 9:09 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Carroll Stadium Lighting

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from concettaeckel@charter.net. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Just say no! Thank You! Len & Concetta Eckel 1506 Jerome PI Helena, MT 59601 Sent from my iPad Comments re: variance for lighting at Carroll College

I am totally against the variance request and ask that you deny it.

Carroll College is asking for a variance from the Helena (City) Board of Adjustments to increase the heights of buildings from 60' to 110'. Specifically, they wish to install new stadium lighting at the athletic stadium. For your reference, the new light poles will be taller than all but St. Charles Hall. Taller than the chapel, the library and the administration building and the residence hall on Benton. In short, no pun intended, the poles will be the second tallest structure on campus.

This 110- foot height is an 8 or 9 story building. Do you see one of these in Helena?

If you view any part of the campus from your home, your work, or your daily travels, you will then see these light poles. Forever. Our views will be slashed. Forget the view from Centennial Park to the northwest. Playing golf. That view of Mt. Helena is gone. Climbing Mt. Helena. Ugh, that view will be changed. Maybe you prefer a bedtime of 8:30 PM. You can learn to read in bed with your lights off. You might grow accustomed to the new show-light function available in stadium lighting. Imagine, Las Vegas night show lights in your front and back yard.

The Civic Center tower, the Fire Tower, the church steeples, Mt. Helena, will all be cheapened by the ugly competition.

The brochure Carroll College printed points out the stadium remodel as an economic gain. If the lighting is deleted, the stadium remodel will still be an economic gain. The brochure doesn't say a thing about taxes paid. Maybe this another one of those 'let the neighbors' deal with it, which will be said if the lights are turned on.

I've talked to people in many neighborhoods about this variance. No one seemed half -heartedly to support this variance. Nearly everyone was opposed, some vehemently.

I'm okay with the Guardian of the Gulch for another 150 years but not 110-foot-tall light poles.

David Curd

930 Hudson Street

Daxon Graham Junior Cornerback

My name is Daxon Graham, and I play football for the Fighting Saints football program. I have been playing for Carroll College for three years now and have some insight on the necessities for the new field complex. The new field complex should include permanent lights for a multitude of reasons. The practices during the fall and spring occur during the early hours of the day when the sun is still down. We have to practice at these times to ensure that all athletes can be available for practice. The lights are a necessity for proper lighting during our practices for the success of the program. The lights would be used nearly year round as we practice during the dark hours of the night consistently. It is a smart investment as in the past the team has had to rent generators and buy fuel for the generators that provide light. These generators are in the way at practice, as they have to sit right on the sideline. For the safety of the players, permanent lights would be much more beneficial. The lights for Nelson stadium would also increase publicity as sports teams could now compete in night games that bring a lot of fans and publicity for the program. All in all, it is a necessity for lights to be included in the new Nelson stadium project. There is no reason that they should not be included. From a player perspective I see a lot more positive aspects rather than negative ones in the inclusion of lights.

From: Deb Massett <debmassett@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 5:53 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Re: NO to lights at Carroll College

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from debmassett@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

NO, absolutely NO to the proposed 110-foot-tall light poles proposed for Carroll College Stadium! This is a ridiculous idea. Let's not trash the Queen City! No! No! No!

Deborah Massett 1611 Laurel Street Helena, MT 59601

On Sat, Dec 2, 2023 at 5:52 PM Deb Massett < debmassett@gmail.com > wrote:

NO, absolutely NO to the proposed 110-foot-tall light polls proposed for Carroll College Stadium! This is a ridiculous idea. Let's not trash the Queen City! N.

Deborah Massett 1611 Laurel Street Helena, MT 59601

From: Diane Bayuk <entremom3@yahoo.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 12:41 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Carroll College Light Variance

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from entremom3@yahoo.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello Mr. Kyle Holland,

I've read with horror of the proposed 110' building variance at Carroll College.

This variance for buildings is the umbrella under which light towers would be built for the stadium.

Please say NO to this objectionable concept.

Lights are often a very offensive human experience in many environments. Those planned for Carroll would affect the entire valley, and take away from the comfortable ambiance within this peaceful city.

We must preserve the beauty of our lovely city, and not cheapen it.

And we must not force all Helenans to suffer the effects of structures requested by a very few for a very small entity.

Thank you for your No vote.

Diane W. Bayuk 1520 Charlie Russell Dr. Helena, MT 59601

From: Gordon Amsbaugh <gtsamsbaugh@gmail.com>

Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 9:52 AM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: carroll lights- no variance!

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from gtsamsbaugh@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Please, more Helena common sense: no light pole variance. Not good for people, not good for animals, not good for Helena

G.D. Amsbaugh

From: gnoosemontana@aol.com

Sent: Sunday, December 3, 2023 7:33 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Written Comments Re Variance Request - New Stadium Lighting at Carroll College

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from gnoosemontana@aol.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

To: Kyle Holland, Planner II

Community Development Department

kholland@helenamt.gov

From: Gregory and Candace Noose

614 Peosta Ave. Helena MT 59601

Written Comments Re Variance Request - New Stadium Lighting at Carroll College

Sunday, December 3, 2023

We are writing to respectfully request that the City Planning Division disallow the request from Carroll College to construct new stadium lighting that exceeds the currently allowed building height of 60 feet.

This variance will adversely affect the important, irreplaceable viewshed that graces this wonderful campus, our historic community and the lovely area that surrounds us.

The towers themselves will detract from the appearance of our community. To drive along the highways of our State is to notice the distraction of dozens of towers and industrial structures that already diminish our scenery and the natural attractiveness of our environment. The premise of high towers emerging from the beautiful campus of Carroll College sadly remind me of the girder- built, steel structure that once disgraced the solemn Gettysburg Battlefield.

The unnatural pollution of a unique, wondrous night sky should also be considered in terms of high, bright lights.

Candy and I have lived within city blocks of the Carroll College Campus for more than 25 years, and we frequently traverse this special place. We treasure the beauty and dignified development that the campus provides to our area. We value the joyfulness of campus / community activities, especially those that fill our neighborhoods with exceptional students and thousands upon thousands of citizens who support these students and enjoy their home. Parking, foot traffic and joyful noise have not been a problem.

Today there are virtually no adverse consequences from the inherent campus bustle. New nighttime activities will add to a positive potential and almost certainly bring about additional community benefits. But we believe that these benefits

can be attained without harming the view or adding to light pollution. This is especially true in consideration of modern advancements in artificial lighting in terms of intensity, directionality and efficiency. We can do better than this plan. Please deny the current request and ask the college to reconsider.

Submitted via email by: Gregory A. Noose Candace L. Noose My name is Hunter Peck and I play football for Carroll. Lights in Nelson Stadium make sense for a multitude of reasons. First off, lights would make practicing in the morning like the Carroll football team and other sports teams possible. The diesel powered lights used previously really don't provide the safest lighting to practice any sport in. Lights would also make it possible for Carroll to host night games and other events at night which would draw more people to the games because the environment of these games are much more live than that in the light. If a nice new turf field is going in why miss out on the opportunity to put up lights.

From: John Moore <jcm@bresnan.net>
Sent: Monday, December 4, 2023 11:59 AM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Comment on variance request

You don't often get email from jcm@bresnan.net. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Mr. Holland,

Please add this comment to the record of the Board of Adjustment's review. Thank you.

I urge the Helena Board of Adjustments to reject the variance request by Carroll College to install lighting at Nelson Stadium. I believe the proposed installation would be both unsightly and unnecessary.

<u>Unsightly</u>: The prospect of 110-foot towers looming over an otherwise picturesque campus is not attractive. The towers would also intrude on the viewscape from several angles, even at a distance. When in use, the lights would be glaringly visible from several angles as well, an unwelcome form of light pollution.

<u>Unnecessary</u>: Although I used the phrase "when in use," it is unclear what use the lighting would serve. Carroll's football and soccer contests have historically been daytime events. During the several years that Carroll used Vigilante Stadium, which has lights, the games occurred in daylight.

Even if the Frontier Conference were to begin scheduling some evening games, it's hard to imagine lighting at Nelson Stadium being used more than half a dozen times a year. This seems a small benefit for a large variance.

For these reasons, I urge the Board to reject the variance request.

John Moore 1014 Hudson St Helena

From: Julie Mitchell <schoolsurvey@hotmail.com>

Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 7:38 AM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Carroll college stadium lights

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from schoolsurvey@hotmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I would like to submit a public comment with regard to the proposed variance for Carroll college stadium lighting. I am strongly opposed to granting this variance. Granting the variance goes against previous commission efforts and community support to maintain dark skies, minimize light pollution and maintain the historic character of Helena. It is not necessary to add these lights to the stadium expansion at the expense of permanently increasing light pollution, disrupting surrounding neighborhoods, adding increased night noise during night events, and altering the views of Helena from various vantage points. Please reject the request for a variance.

Thank you,

Julie Mitchell

From: ken eden <kveden@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, December 4, 2023 10:29 AM

To: Kyle Holland; Andy Shirtliff

Subject: Carroll College Nelson Stadium upgrade

Some people who received this message don't often get email from kveden@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

David Curd's letter to the IR on Dec 2 was a revelation. It provides details of the Nelson stadium upgrade: 110 feet high light poles to illuminate the playing field and artificial turf to replace a grass surface. In reading past articles by president John Cech on the college website and in the Helena IR, there are laudatory descriptions of the project, but details are lacking. Here are a few important ones.

Has Carroll College asked its faculty what the impact of the lights on Dark Skies will be? For students taking astronomy and related physics classes, it is apt to have a very negative effect. For Helena homeowners who enjoy amateur astronomy, the meteor showers, occasional northern lights, or a clear view of our Milky Way galaxy, it will certainly be a disturbing negative.

Has the administration gone online to research the injury rates on the different field surfaces? Are they aware that The NFL players association and the USA World Cup women's team have lobbied for years to require grass on all fields because they feel certain that injuries are more common on artificial "turf?" The USA World Cup men's soccer teams have always had grass surfaces. But notably, The women's 'World Cup have not until recently. The international soccer governing body FIFA finally relented in view of the players' demands. Future World Cups and international competitions for men and women will all be on grass. The college has not commented on these important issues in their publicly available proposals. They have an obligation to do so. Ken Eden, Helena Resident

From: Ken Morrison <skmorr@msn.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 9:01 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: No

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Please, no lights for Carroll's stadium in a residential area of Helena. Sent from my Verizon, Samsung Galaxy smartphone Get <u>Outlook for Android</u>

From: ken eden <kveden@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, December 3, 2023 9:02 PM

To: Andy Shirtliff; Kyle Holland

Subject: Comments regarding the variance for increasing the height of light poles to 110'

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

Some people who received this message don't often get email from kveden@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mr Holland,

We live on LeGrande Cannon Blvd, and have a clear view of Carroll College, the football field and the peaceful Helena Valley. We have watched the Northern lights, meteor showers and beautiful sunsets as they fade into a dark sky.

110 ft tall spotlights will make those treasures disappear. Bright, giant, artificial lights are certainly not needed. In fact, they fly in the face of our goals as stewards of an educated, thoughtful, informed citizenry who enjoy the natural beauty of our community.

I have highlighted several of the "variance criteria" which alone should cause this proposal to not be approved. I am disappointed that Carroll College submitted this plan. It is not what good neighbors do to long standing home owners in their backyard.

1. The variance will not create a significant risk to the public health, safety, or general welfare Bright lights WILL cause significant effects to the general welfare of residents. Will we be able to see the Northern

Lights or the fabulous meteor showers when the lights go on and dark skies disappear?

2. The variance will not significantly reduce or impair the peaceful use of existing property or improvements in the vicinity and the zoning district in which the subject property is located.

It will not be peaceful to have glaring 110' lights shining into windows and obstructing

serene views from citizens who have lived in this area for many years. Those lights will become the fifth highest structures in the State of Montana! And it will devalue properties and citizens will no longer be able to control the night environment they presently enjoy.

Thank you for your consideration of this very important issue, Elizabeth Eden 1030 Legrande Cannon Blvd Helena, Mt. 59601

From: kkputnam76 <kkputnam76@gmail.com> **Sent:** Sunday, December 3, 2023 4:29 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: NO TO CARROLL COLLEGE LIGHTS

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from kkputnam76@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Thank-you for the information about the new lighting at the CC stadium.

I am opposed to their plan.

County Commissions please don't let this happen.

Sent from my T-Mobile 5G Device

Kylie Kackman 920 Harrahs Ct. Helena, MT 59602

RE: Carroll College Nelson Stadium Lights

December 4th, 2023

To Whom It May Concern,

I would like to express my personal support for the entirety of the Carroll College Nelson Stadium renovation project. I fully support the plans to move ahead, specifically with the stadium lights. I believe this will create more opportunities not only for Carroll College teams, but high school teams as well. I also believe that this in turn has a positive economic impact on the Helena community by bringing in business.

As a former Carroll College athlete, I know firsthand the benefits of improvements and support for athletic programs. I was able to obtain a stellar education at Carroll College and move seamlessly into the workforce in the Helena community because of it. I was only able to get where I am today because of my athletic career, and that starts with the infrastructure to do so. It is very important for current and future generations of students and athletes to have the same support for safe, well-lit facilities. The Nelson Stadium renovation has the power to boost Carroll's collegiate athletic programs and Helena community by expanding its offerings and capabilities.

Additionally, I lived roughly three blocks from the college and Nelson Stadium on Lincoln Street for just over two years. I do not see the completed renovation causing a problem to the nearby neighborhood. I do not think lights will obstruct views of the city based upon the location. The lights will be a wonderful addition to allow a wider range of game times and opportunities.

One thing I learned at Carroll was to constantly improve and adapt. I firmly believe this project will be a great improvement with rippling effects throughout the school and into the local economy. Again, my full support is behind the project as a former neighbor and student-athlete.

Sincerely,

Kylie Kackman

From: Loretta Johnson <lorettaj937@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, December 4, 2023 3:19 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Carroll College lights

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from lorettaj937@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I don't want the Board to approve the college's proposal to install new stadium lights. I live right across the street from Carroll and that tall lighting would bother me greatly. The relatively new athletic building they constructed a few years ago already disturbs my nighttime view to the north. Please say no to the variance request. Thank you. Loretta Johnson, 520 Peosta Ave, Helena.

Sent from my iPhone

From: melanie rasor <mvrasor@yahoo.com> **Sent:** Saturday, December 2, 2023 3:04 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Nelson Stadium lights

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from mvrasor@yahoo.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Greetings,

I am emailing you in opposition to the installation of new 110 ft tall light poles at Nelson Stadium.

Yours truly, Melanie Rasor

From: Melissa Curd <melissacurd@yahoo.com>
Sent: Sunday, December 3, 2023 4:06 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: In opposition to the variance

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from melissacurd@yahoo.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

To Whom it May Concern:

I am writing in **opposition** to the proposed variance request to increase the maximum building height from 60' to 110' for the new stadium lighting at Carroll College.

As a single, working mother, I will be unable to attend the public hearing on December 5th, so I am providing my thoughts via e-mail.

For starters, **Carroll College isn't in a good position** to be requesting anything from community members at this point. Just within the last year, the college has shown an astounding lack of judgment:

- Selfishly requesting ARPA funds for this same stadium enhancement project. It should be noted that eligible uses
 of ARPA funds include: public sector revenue replacement, COVID-19 public health expenditures, economic
 support for households and small businesses, premium pay for essential workers, and investments in
 water/sewer/broadband infrastructure. A stadium enhancement project DOES NOT meet any of these
 requirements.
- 2. Selfishly bulldozing homes at the corner of Benton and Lyndale Avenues, during a housing crisis, and choosing to replace the homes with water-intensive grass sod rather than badly needed housing.

Then, let's observe the **lack of communication** in regard to this project.

- 1. Very few community members were notified by mail (approximately 60 property owners). And this mail notice was received less than two weeks prior to the public hearing.
- 2. There was no press release or any other notification to the community about this variance request (aside from a fine print legal notice, and who reads those?).
- 3. This might explain why, as of Monday, November 27, 2023, no public comments had been received.
- 4. When community members were recently notified, by word of mouth, the overwhelming consensus was one of opposition to the lighting project.
- 5. In summary, had Carroll College and the City of Helena bothered to educate the public about the variance request, residents might have had more time to participate in the decision-making process.

Next, let's observe **the variance application** submitted by CWG Architects on behalf of Carroll College. The direct link to the application submission is here. I am completely untrained in matters of zoning and ordinances, but I found several errors and misrepresentations in the application that gave me pause.

- 1. On page 2 of the variance application form, it states that the current maximum height is 65', when in fact it is 60'.
- 2. In the freeform attachment directly following the application, page 2, #3 ("Whether there is a prevalence..."), it states that the peak of All Saints Chapel is 4,190' above sea level. This is incorrect and should be noted as 4,090'.
- 3. In the same freeform attachment, page 3, #8 ("Provide any additional..."), it states that FAA approval was obtained back in 2011. That was 12 years ago. Presumably FAA requirements have changed since then. I would think CWG would do their due diligence and request an updated FAA approval, rather than relying on an outdated one.
- 4. The reasoning CWG uses to support the lighting request is invalid. CWG states that the height at the peak of All Saints Chapel would equal the height of the lights, so therefore, the height of the lights would be in line with existing structures. But the base of All Saints Chapel is near the top of a hill! The actual height of the chapel is only 50'. So there is really no comparison. Not to mention, the chapel is a much more beautiful structure than a light pole.
- 5. CWG also states that the peak of St. Charles Hall is 50' higher than the proposed lights, so therefore the height of the lights should be approved. The Hall is over 100 years old, presumably older than today's zoning restrictions, and it also sits ON THE TOP OF A HILL. It's a beautiful old building, unimposing, and it doesn't emit a harsh light. So, again, there's really no comparison.
- 6. Due to these rather obvious oversights, I am not inspired with confidence that CWG Architects is handling this project appropriately and fairly.

Next, let's refute Carroll College's claims that these lights are necessary.

- 1. The stadium has been unlit for over 20 years, and the Saints have managed to keep playing all this time.
- 2. Most spectators (and players) probably prefer sunny, mid-day games during the colder months, when nighttime games would be quite frigid. Day-time games give travelers the chance to get home safely at night. Night-time games necessitate either a late-night drive home or a costly hotel stay. Neither of which is in the best interests of the spectators and players.
- 3. Nearby residents already get enough light pollution from the lights at the Batch softball fields. I doubt folks are going to enjoy even more and even brighter lights from the stadium, with plans of them being used up to 75 nights per year.
- 4. The light poles will be ugly. Helenans tend to enjoy their views of the mountains. Folks exercising in Centennial park will see their view to the west obscured by light poles. Folks in the vicinity of Bill Roberts golf course and Nature Park will no longer be able to enjoy their full view of Mount Helena.
- 5. The proposed height of the stadium lights, 110', is equivalent to a 9-story building. Where in Helena have you seen a 9-story building? And would you like to see one?
- 6. The lights will be bright. They may not shut off until after 11 pm or midnight, depending on the type of event being hosted. In order for neighbors (and even college students in their dorms) to sleep at night, we will have to purchase blackout shades and eye masks. Sounds fun!
- 7. Most stadiums have their lights mounted at around 60'. Carroll College whines on their website that "other schools in town have lighting appropriate to their needs", but these other schools have light poles that are much lower and are also used less frequently than proposed by the stadium enhancement project (10 nights per year versus 75 nights per year).
- 8. Lastly, Carroll College isn't set apart from the town like many other college campuses are. Carroll College is located right in the middle of Helena. If it was set apart from the town, I could almost agree with the need for lights, because they would affect fewer people.

Finally, let's see how the project could **impact the community** if completed as proposed.

1. <u>Carroll College is proposing</u> holding up to **75 events annually** at Nelson Stadium, with possible attendance of 10,000 or more at each event. Logistically, there is **not enough parking** for these types of events. Carroll College doesn't even have enough parking for their home football games. And don't even think about driving down Benton Avenue on the day of the summer Symphony Under the Stars. During these existing events, people are

force to park very far away, or they end up parking illegally along the railroad tracks, along pedestrian trails, or in someone else's driveway. I am quite sure nearby residents will not appreciate having to put up with 75 such events annually. Not only will parking be an issue, but traffic in general will slow to a snail's pace as spectators arrive to or leave from an event.

- 2. If this variance is approved, Carroll College can build anything else they want up to 110'. They could erect a 9-story building. How would this look on campus?
- 3. **Competition with the Fairgrounds.** In June 2004, Lewis and Clark County voters supported a 10-year mill levy to construct the new grandstand and outdoor performance arena. We have already helped to pay for the Fairgrounds to be used as an event venue. Now Carroll College is saying they can do better. What happens to the grandstand that we all paid for if Carroll College siphons all large events to their Nelson Stadium? Also to note: the Fairgrounds already has plenty of available parking!

One last fun fact: How is it that the peak of Nelson Stadium is currently taller than allowed by the existing ordinance? The peak is 61'6". The current height limitation is 60'. How did Carroll College get away with that?

Finally, according to Section 11-5-5 of the Helena Zoning Ordinance, the **Board of Adjustment must consider the following standards** when reviewing a requested variance:

- 1. The variance will not create a significant risk to the public health, safety, or general welfare;
- 2. The variance will not significantly reduce or impair the peaceful use of existing property or improvements in the vicinity and the zoning district in which the subject property is located; and
- 3. Strict compliance with the provisions of this title would create unnecessary hardship or practical difficulty.

There are the **additional factors** that the Board of Adjustment may consider:

- 1. Special conditions and circumstances that are unique to the applicant's site, including the size of the property, unusual or extreme topography, or unusual shape of the property.
- 2. The height, location, or dimensions of existing structures located on the site or in the vicinity of the site.
- 3. Whether there is a prevalence of nonconformities in the vicinity of the site that are similar to the variance requested.
- 4. The subsequent imposition of zoning restrictions creating nonconforming lots or parcels, and governmental actions beyond the applicant's control.
- 5. Whether a literal interpretation of the provisions of this Title would deprive the property owner of rights commonly enjoyed by other properties similarly situated in the same district under the terms of this Title.
- 6. The extent to which the hardship or difficulty results from the actions of the applicant.
- 7. Whether granting the variance requested will confer an unreasonable special privilege to the subject property that is not available to other properties similarly located in the same zoning district.

If the Board considers these questions fully, beyond the scope of the answers CWG provided in their application, I believe the Board will agree to **oppose the variance**.

believe the Board will agree to oppose the variance .	
Thank you for your time and consideration.	

Melissa Curd

Sincerely,

Sent from Yahoo Mail on Android

From: Nancy Davis <nancy.davis@q.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 2:15 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: lights at Carroll College

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from nancy.davis@q.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

We do NOT need lights at the Carroll Stadium. We don't even have street lights in our neighborhood. No to light pollution!! Let Carroll stay quaint & energy conscious!!!! Don't waste our energy on stadium lights. Waste our tax dollars & destroy our star light! I SAY NO!!!

Nancy Davis 906 Hudson St

From: Polly Pfister <ppfister@mt.net>
Sent: Monday, December 4, 2023 9:01 AM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: NO lights at Carroll

Follow Up Flag: Follow up Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from ppfister@mt.net. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I 100% OPPOSE allowing the proposed towering lights at Carroll College.

We live at the base of Mt. Helena, and stadium lights already shine in our windows at night, totally intrusive & unwanted. Carroll's proposed light towers would be much, much worse, and would shine obnoxiously right into our living room windows. The City needs to stop Carroll's monstrous light proposal in its tracks and stand up for the thousands of residents into whose lives such obnoxious lights would intrude, and JUST SAY NO!!!

Polly Pfister

Helena, MT

From: Randy Coty <cotyak@hotmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 5:21 AM

To:Kyle HollandSubject:Light Poles

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from cotyak@hotmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

No lights please at Carroll College stadium.

Randall Coty Helena, MT

From: Scott Miller <smillerhln@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, December 3, 2023 9:51 AM

To: Kyle Holland **Subject:** No to CC lights

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from smillerhln@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Lights will have a negative impact on the neighborhood close to campus. Currently, students living in the neighborhood have excessive parties to which CC can't do anything about and the citizens living in the area try to use proper channels but get no results. Night games, more speedy traffic at night, all day parties...add it up and it spells bad news for that neighborhood.

From: john maki <troutmontana@yahoo.com>
Sent: Saturday, December 2, 2023 3:43 PM

To:Kyle HollandSubject:Stadium lights

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

[You don't often get email from troutmontana@yahoo.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I say no to taller lights. Susan Tester Maki Sent from my iPhone

From: Tim and Sioux Roth <rtsioux@msn.com>
Sent: Sunday, December 3, 2023 4:20 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Lighting at Nelson Stadium

Follow Up Flag: Flag for follow up

Flag Status: Flagged

You don't often get email from rtsioux@msn.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hello,

I am opposed to the stadium lights, at 110' high, these lights will be invasive!

I'm sure there is an alternative that would be effective without affecting our neighborhood with unwanted glaring lights blinding us.

The Community Development Department must explore alternative ways to light the stadium before granting a variance.

I am surprised that this was not better advertised to the residents way before now.

Sincerely,

Tim Roth

116 Fairway Dr.

From: DAN GILMORE <ggilmore3953@msn.com>
Sent: Monday, December 4, 2023 4:28 PM

To: Kyle Holland

Subject: Carroll College lighting

[You don't often get email from ggilmore3953@msn.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi,

I'm writing to the issue of new stadium lighting being proposed on the Carroll College campus.

We have lived in Helena 50 plus years and currently live on Strawberry Drive, south hill behind the state Capital. We love the view of the Capital, the Cathedral, Scratchgravel Hills, Lake Helena, Sleeping Giant, etc. We citizens are so fortunate to all these beautiful views. Helena has been quaint and unique for years, a beautiful community. We love Carroll College and it is a great addition to Helena.

Why does the stadium need lights? Carrol began in 1909 and Carroll football started in 1920. In 100 years the team has done very well without stadium lights. If they needed to play under lights the could use Vigilante Stadium which they used for years. That stadium has more seating than Carroll. Is Carroll football seating ever sold out, not often. What advantage does it bring? The enrollment in the fall of 2022 was 1160 students. It is in the NAIA Division, not Norte Dame.

The lights on TALL poles would be a huge eyesore. Has there been a study as to how the light will be projected, LED lights or softer lights, color quality, quantity the light produced? Will there be light trespass where light is extending further than it should? Could it be visible inside homes when on? In the agreement would it be stated as to when the lights are on, for games only, how many games, used during practices, used for other things, what months? The pole lamp, above what is normal for Helena, will they be decorative, modern, updated in design?

Good lighting doesn't always make good neighbors. Ambient noise accompanies night games.

Carroll is buying used lights from another city, are they an old lighting system?

Are they unshielded flood lights and do they illuminate more than the playing field, such as spill light, glare, sky glow. Why does the College need night games?

Could all the citizens of Helena vote on the whether this is a necessity and if people feel a need for our community? I think it should go on a ballot. Let the citizens decide.

Please don't rush to a approval decision. This affects our citizens and the looks of our community. I love looking out and really feel this could be a huge obstruction, and I really don't see a need. My understanding is that Carroll has had a decline in enrollment these last few years and I don't see stadium lighting drawing new students to Carroll or produce more football champions, both the school and football team have done very well without lights.

Thank you, Gayle Gilmore 1091 Strawberry Drive Helena, Mt

Sent from my iPad

December 4, 2023

Kyle Holland, AIA Planner II, Community Development Dept. Room 403 City County Building Helena, MT 59601

Delivered via email: Kholland@helenamt.gov

Dear Mr. Holland:

I am writing this letter in strong support of the Carroll College Turf and Lighting Project.

Carroll College is an integral part of our community and a project like this will enhance athletic recruiting, hosting of athletic events and allow for even better partnering with other youth athletic events that are currently underserved due to lack of sports facilities in our community. The long-term viability of Carroll College is essential for our community and projects like this keep them competitive with other Colleges and Universities. This will be a great enhancement to the already existing Nelson Stadium and usage, and knowing how the lights work the field and stadium will be well lit with minimal disruption to any surrounding areas.

The durability and flexibility of the turf and lighting project will enhance Carroll College and our community, and I hope this project is permitted to move forward.

Sincerely,

Nate McCarthy 406.465.6382