| From: | Angela Roberts <roberts.angelaj@gmail.com></roberts.angelaj@gmail.com> |
|-----------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 5:47 AM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | No Lights at Stadium |
| Follow Up Flag: | Flag for follow up |
| Flag Status: | Completed |

You don't often get email from roberts.angelaj@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mr. Holland,

I am writing to request that you DENY the variance sought by Carroll College to construct 110' lights at their stadium.

Such tall lights would contribute to light pollution and be an eyesore to the whole city. The living room window in our house faces east towards the stadium, and between the proposed stadium lights and those already on all night at Cretex Concrete, our house will be as bright as day.

Carroll College has a long history of producing successful soccer and football teams, and drawing large crowds to home games without such tall lights.

Please deny this proposal.

Respectfully,

Angela Roberts 918 Hudson St. Helena

From: Sent: To: Subject: fjnaeher <fjnaeher@charter.net> Tuesday, December 5, 2023 1:37 PM Kyle Holland No 110 foot lights

You don't often get email from fjnaeher@charter.net. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Please do not allow Carrol College a variance for 110 foot lights. They will be an eye sore and yet another source of light pollution. What"s wrong with the lights they have now? How will it affect the aviation community, especially the Guard helicopter pilots? Thanks, Fred and Joyce Naeher. 4064372570

| From: | George Ochenski <ochenski@mt.net></ochenski@mt.net> |
|----------|-----------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 12:03 PM |
| То: | Kyle Holland; Sean Logan |
| Subject: | NO to Carroll light variance |

[You don't often get email from ochenski@mt.net. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

To Whom It May Concern:

I was appointed by Mayor Colleen McCarthy and served on the Helena Lighting Ordinance committee and was largely responsible for initiating

the process to develop and implement a light ordinance for Helena. The

reasons to try and preserve Helena's dwindling "dark sky" are many, from light trespass to allowing present and future generations to enjoy the wonders of the night sky, the constellations, and to diminish the harmful effects of municipal lights on wildlife, primarily migrating birds such as geese.

The ordinance grandfathered in the lights for the cathedral and Capitol, but put significant sidebars on other light sources, particularly billboards with upward pointing lights and flashing advertising displays.

The variance sought by Carroll College for its proposed lighting for the football field will simply make a laughing stock out of the ordinance and leave Helenans with even less of a real "night sky" than we have now -- and thanks to continued growth, it's already significantly diminished from what it was when we passed the lighting ordinance all those years ago.

The simple truth is the Carroll lights will serve only a very tiny portion of Helena's population while impacting the vast majority of residents subjected to its "eye in the sky" glare due to the extreme height of over 100 vertical feet.

Please record this email as strong opposition to issuing the variance.

Carroll is a small Catholic college, not some major university, and the last thing we need is more very bright lights in Helena for any reason, let alone football games, etc., at night. There is no proven "economic benefit" as lauded by the college and even if there was some slight advantage to having an even more brightly lit field, the impacts far, far outweigh the benefits.

The City -- and its government -- is charged to do the greatest good for the greatest number -- not to hand out variances to small special interests that impact "the greatest number" of its residents.

George Ochenski

Helena, Montana

| From: | Lynn Hinch & Jim Mullins <mullinshinch@gmail.com></mullinshinch@gmail.com> |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 8:36 AM |
| То: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | Proposed Lighting at Carroll College |

You don't often get email from mullinshinch@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Mr. Holland,

I am writing to also express my dismay at hearing of the Carroll proposed extreme lighting at their fields. I am against the additional light pollution that would occur with this stadium lighting.

Thank you for your consideration.

Jim Mullins 928 Waukesha Ave. Helena MT 59601

| From: | Larry Thomas < Ithomas73@gmail.com> |
|----------|-------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 9:55 AM |
| То: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | CC Football Stadium Variance |

[You don't often get email from lthomas73@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Kyle Holland

When considering the variance for pole height at Carroll College Stadium please keep in mind the economic impact this would bring to the Helena Community and approve the request

Larry Thomas Sent from my iPhone

| From: | Lynn Hinch & Jim Mullins <mullinshinch@gmail.com></mullinshinch@gmail.com> |
|-----------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Monday, December 4, 2023 11:00 PM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | Proposed Lighting at Carroll College |
| Follow Up Flag: | Flag for follow up |
| Flag Status: | Completed |

You don't often get email from mullinshinch@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Mr. Holland,

I would like to express my opposition to the construction of the proposed lighting at Carroll College. The lights would contribute to light pollution in the area and be an eyesore that would mar the view of the campus due to their extreme height.

Lynn Hinch 928 Waukesha Helena MT 59601 My name is Max Lehman, a junior running back for the Carroll College football team. Installing lights in Nelson Stadium would greatly benefit both our athletic teams and the community of Helena. Having lights installed in Nelson stadium allows the football team to hold morning practices with adequate lighting without having to use diesel-powered generator lights to light the field. The lights could allow Carroll to hold night football and soccer games and different athletic events which would provide supporters and players with an electric game-time atmosphere. Community events like concerts and Thursday/Friday night high school football games could be hosted with the addition of lights. Lights would add a tremendous amount of value to Nelson Stadium and seem important to many athletes on our campus.

| From: | Michael Garrity <wildrockies@gmail.com></wildrockies@gmail.com> |
|-----------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 12:44 PM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | Oppose Carroll College's request for a variance |
| Follow Up Flag: | Flag for follow up |
| Flag Status: | Completed |

You don't often get email from wildrockies@gmail.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mr. Holland,

I am opposed to Carroll College's request for a variance to the light ordnance so they can build 110 feet tall stadium lighting at the football stadium.

I like looking at the stars at night. The last thing Helena needs is more light pollution.

Light pollution also interferes with birds' long distance migration and reduces bird breeding success. Bird populations have declined by 3 billion since 1970. Why do we want to make it harder for birds to survive?

I am also requesting that the city start enforcing the light ordinance on billboards, which requires downward facing lights. From what I can tell, almost every lighted billboard in Helena has upward facing lights.

Thank you for your time and consideration of my comments.

Sincerely yours, Mike Garrity P.O. Box 505 Helena, MT 59624

| From: | monte Egeland <mdegeland@charter.net></mdegeland@charter.net> |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Monday, December 4, 2023 5:19 PM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | Support for the Carroll College stadium light project. |
| Follow Up Flag: | Flag for follow up |
| Flag Status: | Flagged |

You don't often get email from mdegeland@charter.net. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Mr Kyle Holland,

I understand you are in the approval loop for the Carroll College stadium light proposal

I would request that you vote yes on this proposal so those lights can be approved and scheduled to be added as part of the stadium upgrade project.

Sincerely,

Monte Dean Egeland Helena MT 59601

Sent from my T-Mobile 5G Device Get <u>Outlook for Android</u>

| From: | Philip Porrini <philporrini@aol.com></philporrini@aol.com> |
|-----------------|------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 10:39 AM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Cc: | Charles Gross |
| Subject: | Carroll College - Nelson Stadium Light Pole Variance |
| Follow Up Flag: | Follow up |
| Flag Status: | Flagged |

You don't often get email from philporrini@aol.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Kyle Holland, AIA Planner II Community Development Department City of Helena, MT

I am writing to express my **<u>support</u>** for the variance requested by Carroll College to construct new light poles at Nelson Stadium.

The basis for my support comes from:

- living in Helena for 49 years and seeing the enormous community benefits of having Carroll College in the center of our city,
- formerly owning a home (for 15+years), one block west of the campus (500 Hollins) and knowing the neighborhood challenges but the overall minimal impact to daily activities,
- currently living outside the variance notification zone (on Legrande Cannon Blvd) but having a direct view to the Nelson Stadium grandstands, yet my perspective is that the extended light poles <u>will not</u> create an obstruction to my view scape. There are many features (commercial buildings, homes, trees, power lines, railroad tracks, etc) that can be seen each day from our home, yet none are considered obstructions to us,
- the benefits of installing stadium lights will provide opportunities for even greater community use,
- designed stadium lights that shine DOWN on the playing field will reduce widening the glare and thus impacts to surrounding areas,
- the location of Nelson Stadium is surrounded by institutional, industrial & recreational uses (Carroll College campus, Concrete Pipe Manufacturing, Waste Transfer Station, Batch Softball Field {lighted} and Bill Roberts Golf Course, and Centennial Park). Nelson Stadium is setback off Benton Ave, with open space and landscaping and provides a good buffer to residential neighborhood.

Not only will the improvements (turf and lights) to Nelson Stadium benefit Carroll College, but these improvements will also be a great community asset.

Thank you for considering these comments.

Phil Porrini 1221 Legrande Cannon Blvd. Helena, MT 59601 406 465-4143

| From: | Sean Blomquist <sblomquist43@gmail.com></sblomquist43@gmail.com> |
|-----------------|------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Monday, December 4, 2023 6:35 PM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | Nelson Stadium Lighting |
| Follow Up Flag: | Flag for follow up |
| Flag Status: | Flagged |

[You don't often get email from sblomquist43@gmail.com. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Hi Kyle,

I am writing to support the variance to install lighting for Nelson Stadium.

I know there is a meeting tomorrow evening, I hope the community support of this project exemplifies the need for this to be approved.

Thanks, Sean Blomquist Sent from my iPhone

| From: | Timothy Kelly <tskpkelly@bresnan.net></tskpkelly@bresnan.net> |
|-----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 1:10 PM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | Carroll College stadium lights variance |
| Follow Up Flag: | Flag for follow up |
| Flag Status: | Flagged |

[You don't often get email from tskpkelly@bresnan.net. Learn why this is important at https://aka.ms/LearnAboutSenderIdentification]

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Mr. Holland;

The I am writing to encourage you to ratify the variance to allow Carroll College to install lights at Nelson Stadium. These lights will allow the stadium to become a true asset not only to Carroll but to the Helena community with minimal adverse impacts on the neighborhood.

The height of the light poles is determined by engineers for allowing the most efficient illumination of the playing field and will create minimal diffused light.

Thank you for your consideration.

Tim Kelly

Helena, MT

Sent from my iPhone



General Public Comment Form

The following information will be archived in a public record database, accessible online. To view all submitted comments visit the <u>Public</u> <u>Comment Repository</u>.

| Control has templatized attribute(s) with inv | valid templatized dependencies. Ir | valid depende | ncies: [63ABA158]. Please | |
|----------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------|---------------|---------------------------|--|
| edit to correct and then save and reload the form. | | | | |
| First Name | Last Na | me | | |
| Margaret | Regan | | | |
| EMail | | | | |
| mregan@mt.net | | | | |
| Address | | | | |
| 318 Chaucer Street | | | | |
| City | | ST | Zip Code | |
| Helena | | MT | 59601 | |
| Phone | | | | |
| 4064313939 | | | | |

Please enter your public commentary below. This is generic public comment form and will be archived, as such. The Mayor and City Commissioners will recieve a copy of this form. For those wishing to speak directly to their elected officials on specific agenda items, attendance of a public meeting is strongly encouraged.

Meeting agendas can be found here: Agenda Archives

You may also reach out directly to the elected officials via email by visiting: Mayor & Commissioners Page

If you have a request for service, please download the My Helena App or visit: <u>My Helena App</u>.

Join a conversation with other citizens at Helena's Public Engagement website: <u>Be Heard Helena</u>.

*If you register a question in the comment section below please note, the question will be recorded as general public comment and may not necessarily receive a response. Date

12/5/2023 3:30 PM

Comment Type:

- General Public Comment no related agenda
- O Regular City Commission
- O Administrative Meeting
- O Special Meeting / Work Session
- O Boards/Committee Meeting

Meeting Date (if applicable):

Agenda Item Reference: (Please indicate agenda section including the number & letter. Example: 12B)

Public Comments:

December 5, 2023

Dear City Commissioner and City Planners:

I am concerned about the variance application of Carroll College. The application is for the height of the poles, as though there is no issue about the lighting that will then be installed upon them. I think Carroll would need a variance for the lights themselves. I am concerned about both.

There are three issues related to outdoor sports lighting - spill light, glare and sky glow. Spill light is the light that trespasses onto adjacent property. Even more significant is glare, the excessively bright light that reduces your ability to see. This extends far beyond the adjacent neighborhood of BentonAvenue, and will effect a broad swath of Helena. And lastly sky glow, the light that overflows into the sky above the horizon.

Our community values dark skies, as is obvious from this document: https://www.helenamt.gov/files/assets/helena/v/1/government/citizens-

council/documents/hcc_streetlighting_recommendations_final.pdf

Our current city code reflects this:

LIGHTING GENERALLY, 10-1-1: PURPOSE AND INTENT:

It is the purpose and intent of this title to encourage lighting practices and systems which will minimize light pollution, glare, and light trespass; conserve energy and resources while maintaining nighttime safety, utility, and security; and reverse the degradation of the nighttime visual environment. It is recognized that the topography, atmospheric conditions, and nature of the city are unique and valuable to the community. The city, through the provisions contained in this title, promotes the reduction of light pollution that interferes with enjoyment of the night sky. (Ord. 2889, 1-24-2000)

Perhaps Carroll considers itself exempt from City Code, 10-2-6: EXEMPTIONS:

D Public Recreational Lighting: Public recreational lighting. (Ord. 2889, 1-24-2000)

However Carroll College, is a private, not public, institution, and does not qualify for this exemption. There was a recent reconfiguration of Vigilante Stadium lighting. It differed from Carroll's proposal in significant ways. It was a redo of existing lighting, not a new installation. More significantly, it was on public school property, exempt under 10-2-6:D. It appears that there was no variance requested or received for the Vigilante project...

Carroll's proposal is largely unknown within Helena. Many people no longer subscribe to the IR or watch the local news. I ask that there be an opportunity for the Helena citizens to discuss this project before this variance is granted. Without a community conversation, it will feel like the city staff and commission is not being responsive or respectful to Helena citizens. If appropriate, someone may contact you. Would you like to be contacted by a City representative?

- Yes
- O No

What is your preferred method to be contacted?

- O Email
- Phone
- O Mail

Public Information Acknowledgment

✓ I certify I am over the age of 18,and I understand that by submitting this form the information provided is considered a public record pursuant to Title 2 Chapter 6 of the Montana Code Annotated

Signature

what Ry

12/5/2023

Kyle Holland, AIA Planner II, Community Development Dept.

Please accept this as a letter of support for Carroll College as they seek a variance to bring both artificial turf and lights to Nelson Stadium located on their campus. In full disclosure, I am a graduate of Carroll and played football for the school back in the 80's at Vigilante Stadium. I currently serve as the Activities Director for Helena Schools, but I am writing this letter of support not as a representative of the school district but as a supporter of Carroll. I am able offer my direct knowledge of the impact of lights at a stadium during football games in a residential neighborhood. I host a minimum of ten and as many as thirteen home football games on Friday nights at Vigilante Stadium. Each of those games played under lights from August to November each year. We have also needed to turn on the lights to complete early season track meets in April.

During our football season, our lights are on for roughly three to five hours each Friday depending upon the month and onset of darkness. Today's modern stadium lighting systems allow us to turn the lights down to 20% output as soon as our games end, dramatically reducing the ambient light in the neighborhood as soon as the game is completed, and the cleanup process begins. Our modern LED lights were designed to put maximum lighting on the playing surface with as minimal overshot to the neighborhood as possible. If you have been to Vigilante Stadium, you know that our facility rests squarely in a residential neighborhood. We do not have hundreds of feet of separation from our light poles to surrounding homes, literally, two of our light poles sit across the street from houses. I bring this all up because in the three seasons we have had our newly designed lighting system I have had one complaint from a neighbor about the lights during a game. I have had several calls from neighbors regarding the lights turning themselves on when no event was taking place but that was traced to a software issue that we resolved by turning off all power to each pole at the end of the event guaranteeing the lights have no power and cannot turn on until power is restored.

I feel the need to address a potential conflict others may feel I may have that would cause my opinion to be distorted and selfserving. I am sure many will feel there is an agreement to have our high school games played at Nelson Stadium. The simple fact is that no such agreement exists. Yess, the school district has been asked if we would be interested in using Nelson as a site for our own home football games. But that decision has not been made and there have only been limited discussions about that happening. We have a football field; no one in the school district, me, our superintendent, or our head coaches are looking to leave Vigilante Stadium, the district's home football field for over fifty years. The only way a move of that nature would occur is after many meetings, a solid MOU and our districts stakeholder being convinced it is the best move for our students and district. My letter of support is in no way tied to such a move for the school district. This letter is simply written out of my personal support for Carroll and trying to share information with you regarding the impact of lights on a residential neighborhood that I have experienced as I carry out my duties hosting events, outdoors, under lights.

I believe the Nelson Stadium project currently being discussed is a step forward for both the College and our community as well. The opportunity for a modern, lighted, outdoor stadium in Helena is exciting for the college and I believe should be exciting for our community. I encourage you to gather information about the requested variance. Find out for yourself how these new modern stadium light systems are designed and work to focus light down to the playing surface rather than out to the neighborhood.

Thank you for your time, Tim McMahon

| From: | Julie Curd <jcurdcpa@aol.com></jcurdcpa@aol.com> |
|-----------------|--------------------------------------------------|
| Sent: | Tuesday, December 5, 2023 3:35 PM |
| To: | Kyle Holland |
| Subject: | Carroll College Variance Request |
| Follow Up Flag: | Follow up |
| Flag Status: | Flagged |

You don't often get email from jcurdcpa@aol.com. Learn why this is important

CAUTION: This email originated from outside of the organization. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Dear Helena Board of Adjustments:

I urge you to vote "No" on the variance request from Carroll College to increase building height to 110 feet for new stadium lighting.

Here's why:

1. The lights will ruin our skyline: They will tower over the city and be visible for several miles. This will permanently change the character of our city's landscape.

2. The lights will be an eyesore during the day: The massive structures will be hard to ignore, even when they're not in use. They will become a constant visual distraction.

3. They will create light pollution at night: The bright lights will shine into homes across the area, disrupting sleep and affecting quality of life.

4. This proposal lacks adequate community notice: Many residents who will be impacted by this change have not been informed.

Please protect Helena's beauty and the well-being of its residents by rejecting this proposal.

Thank you for your time and consideration.

Sincerely, Julie Curd 930 Hudson St. Helena, MT