



City of Helena

GOLF ADVISORY BOARD SUMMARY April 12, 2016



- | | |
|---|--|
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Pete Aspinwall | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Christopher DeVerniero |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Dave Bauer | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Arthur Pembroke |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Kelly Casey | <input type="checkbox"/> Lynn Staley <i>excused</i> |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Andy Cottrell <i>excused</i> | |

Ex-Officio Members

- Larry Kurokawa, Golf Course Superintendent *excused*
- Scott Longenecker, Head Golf Pro
- Amy Teegarden, Parks and Recreation Director
- Jennifer Schade, Recorder

LOCATION: City-County Building, Room 326

1. Call to order/establish quorum/review agenda

The Golf Advisory Board was called to order at 12:00 pm. Chairman Pete Aspinwall established a quorum.

2. Approval of minutes: March 8, 2016

After review of the minutes, Dave made a motion to approve the minutes as presented. Kelly seconded. Motion carried.

3. Old business

Review RFP's

- Amy began this discussion by stating that there were four RFP's submitted for review. The four companies that submitted a RFP included: PROS Consulting, National Golf Association, THK Associates, and On Course Operations. The subcommittee (which consisted of Dave Bauer, Kelly Casey, Scott Longenecker, and Amy) met April 11th to evaluate and rank each RFP. The committee first developed review criteria. They then used this criterion to rank each company. When they met April 11th, the first order of business was to add up everyone's scores.
- The committee went through each proposal and documented the pros and/or cons of the proposal. As a result of this process, some of the scores changed.
- Amy stated the committee came to a consensus and all agreed that PROS Consulting came in with the lowest scores – the roles were not explained and they gave very generic responses. They lacked an understanding of what we are looking for.
- Our top scorer was the National Golf Foundation (NGF). Highlights of their RFP included:
 - ✚ A very detailed plan and process.

Mission Statement: The Bill Roberts Golf Course is committed to providing a high quality, friendly, and affordable public golfing experience for all ages and abilities within the greater Helena community!

- ✚ Relevant experience and staff roles were well defined.
 - ✚ Provided identified deliverables.
 - ✚ They offered us a pro forma comparison – essentially taking recommendations and alternatives and giving us a 5 and 10 year comparison with the status quo of what we are already doing.
 - ✚ They have a very good understanding of what we are looking for. They have a national perspective.
 - ✚ They offered a good timeline with corresponding tasks and costs.
 - ✚ They have staff with food and beverage experience. This was the only proposal that really talked about food and beverage.
- We can go through all this information in more detail; however, Amy has all the score sheets and proposals if anyone wants to review them.
 - Amy then provided a handout that includes pertinent pages from NGF’s proposal. She highlighted some areas of particular interest to the committee.
 - Amy stated that the subcommittee is making the recommendation to the Golf Advisory Board as a review committee that we begin the process by completing a reference check on the NGF. They would like permission to negotiate and fine-tune some of the deliverables and enter into a contract with the National Golf Foundation.
 - Page 8 of the handout from NGF shows the proposed professional fee and project timeline (see below):

	TIMING	PROFESSIONAL FEE
Task 1 – Project Coordination and Site Visit	1 Week	\$6,000.00
Task 2 – BRGC Facility Evaluation	3 Weeks	\$7,000.00
Task 3 – Market Analysis	1 Week	\$2,000.00
Task 4 – Analysis and Recommendations for Enhancing Revenue	2-3 Weeks	\$3,000.00
Task 5 – Financial Projections	1 Week	\$2,000.00
Projected Expenses (2 Trips – Not to Exceed Cost)		\$4,500.00
TOTAL		\$24,500.00

- In the past few months, the board discussed an amount of \$15,000, but if you look at all the proposals, the average is \$22,000. The subcommittee did not talk price until after everyone submitted their scores.
- The subcommittee felt NGF had a good understanding of our project. Their framework, timeline, and deliverables are easy to understand and will help us get us a product we are interested in. They can meet our timeframes so we are looking at 8-9 weeks from the time of the field visit and that will all be based on when we can issue a contract.
- Amy said that one of the projects NGF completed resulted in a recommendation to not move forward with an expansion of the clubhouse. In our RFP we actually stated this – “to expand (or not to)”. This resonated with the committee as well.
- Pete thanked the committee for their efforts. It appears the group did a thorough and complete job of evaluations.

Mission Statement: The Bill Roberts Golf Course is committed to providing a high quality, friendly, and affordable public golfing experience for all ages and abilities within the greater Helena community!

- Pete felt NGF did a very thoughtful and complete job in responding to our RFP. He concurs with the subcommittee recommendation and award the contract to NGF.
- Dave asked Amy if she will now contact NGF. Amy stated for due diligence, she will contact a couple of their references first. Scott recommended Amy contact the golf course where they **didn't** recommend expansion and ask why.
- For the sake of time, Amy is recommending that unless she sees red flags, she will begin working with the city attorney's office on a contract.
- Amy asked that the board review the contract deliverables that NGF has provided and see if there is anything missing. These deliverables will be written into the contract. She will need to consult with the city attorney, but believes we can go with the cost presented by NGF.
- Art stated that given the fact that we went through the RFI process and had a subcommittee rank based off specific criteria, we are well-grounded to move forward. Amy will review the process with the city attorney.
- The next step will be to secure up funding for the project. This is a conversation Amy will have with the city manager to see if he is comfortable with us using cash reserves. If that doesn't work, we will need to add this amount into the 2017 budget which would delay this until July but Amy has already had a conversation with Ron and he knows we would like to proceed earlier.
- Amy doesn't believe the contract will vary from these deliverables. Amy said the essence of the RFP is the proposed professional fee and project timeline table as listed on page 8.
- Amy then captured some of what is included in the RFP.
 - NGF Consulting representatives will visit Helena. They want to hold meetings with staff and conduct interviews with key stakeholders of BRGC as defined by us to include men's and women's league, the golf advisory board and possibly the city manager and the city financial staff.
 - Based on the goals of the City, we may also want to implement NGF's golfer survey program (GolfSat) at BRGC. Art stated this would be a great opportunity to reach everyone on the website.
- Amy stated the tasks are all defined which result in deliverables. NGF will give us a presentation of preliminary findings and we can schedule this to be part of our regular golf advisory board meeting. We will then receive a written detailed report of findings, recommendations, and documentation as well as an executive summary.
- Task 5 does the financial projections – for comparison purposes, NGF will also provide a 5-year pro forma assuming “as is” operations and no new capital investment or service programs. NGF's financial pro formas are prepared for feasibility purposes and therefore will be conservative and unbiased (i.e., this is what it costs if you do nothing more than meet ADA compliance with no new revenue).
- A formal presentation of findings will be given before the Golf Advisory Board and City Commission by the lead consultant at a fall 2016 administrative meeting. This presentation will include a concise PowerPoint summary of all key findings and recommendations. This will lead us up to 2017 golf fees, capital planning, and budget cycle for a recommendation.

Mission Statement: The Bill Roberts Golf Course is committed to providing a high quality, friendly, and affordable public golfing experience for all ages and abilities within the greater Helena community!

- Chris asked Amy if we received a bio from any of these companies. Amy said that we received key contact information from NGF. The primary contacts for this company will be Richard Singer, Senior Director of Consulting Services and Edward Getherall, Director of Consulting Services (who is listed as a respected industry authority on food and beverage operations and clubhouse renovation/replacement).
- Amy then asked if anyone feels we are missing anything in the deliverables. Also, do we feel we can be responsive to their process and timeframes? This will require staff time and golf advisory board as well as engagement of our golfers and our leagues.
- Pete stated he believes we already have good buy-in. We have strong loyalty to our course. People are pushing us to get this done.
- Pete called for a motion to accept the recommendations of the committee pending Amy's call to references. Art moved. Chris seconded. Motion carried.

FOLLOW-UP ITEM: Amy will contact references and work with the city attorney to create a contract with National Golf Foundation.

4. New business

- Amy – asked the committee if is there any new business to look at discussing or will this effort take up the majority of our time? The consensus of the committee is that this is our primary project.

5. Reports

- Parks and Recreation Director's Report
 - On May 11th, we have our budget meeting with the city commission. This is our opportunity to discuss all parks and recreation budgets to include BRGC.
 - April 29th is National Arbor Day and will be planting a tree in Barney Park at noon in memory of Carol Kirkland.
- Golf Superintendent Report
 - Scott – the weather has been good. We had 2,149 rounds in March compared to 2,526 rounds last year at this time, so we are down slightly in March.
 - April has been very busy – we had a 300 round day last Friday.
 - Scott then asked if anyone had any questions on the financials on the year to date or March specifically. Kelly – why is there a decrease in passes this year? Last year, at this time, our sales were \$124,786 – this year is our sales are only \$93,868. Pete is also concerned about this substantial drop in sales. Scott stated we do have a significant amount of golfers that winter in Arizona. We most likely won't rally until May. Once league starts, we will have a better count.
 - Green fees are up to date and that is based mainly on the simulator.
 - Scott said that April 18th is the first night of men's league. The week following is when women's league will begin.
 - We will also have our demo day which will be Friday, April 29 from 1 pm to 5 pm. Some companies represented will include: TaylorMade, Nike, Cobra, Callaway, and Mizuno.

Mission Statement: The Bill Roberts Golf Course is committed to providing a high quality, friendly, and affordable public golfing experience for all ages and abilities within the greater Helena community!

- Restaurant sales have been pretty good. We had to open early. We have had a couple \$1,000 days in sales which about average to what we do in June and July.
- Pete stated the food is very good. Scott said Jeff will be updating the menu with some lighter options. Scott noticed it seems to be more open and cleaner. The shop recently obtained a new 65" TV. He really likes where things headed.
- Marshall Decision – Scott stated they recently reviewed the marshal's schedules. Last year we had marshals on the course every day from 8 am – 4 pm and we also had some evening positions. On Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday, and Thursday we primarily have the same people at the same times on the course. There haven't been any issues of slow play during this time. Friday has notoriously been a problem. Because of this, Scott has decided that it is not necessary to have marshals Monday through Thursday during the day. We will still have evening marshals.
- Scott then stated we have had some issues with vandalism in the last month. Kids were on the practice green throwing rocks at the light pole. There was also some damage to the meters by the pump stations. We've had about five instances. Last time, they took down the pole. We are getting surveillance cameras that should be going in shortly. They will be on the outside looking down at the carts, putting green, driving range and in the pro shop and office covering the safe.
- Dave – can we put cameras in specific areas on the course? If we experience issues on #3 green, is there some way we can put something out on that hole? Scott stated it would have to be a wireless system. He added that vandalism is reported to the police department. We have requested additional security. They started early this year. Usually additional security efforts begin the last week of school.
- Art added that if we specific areas on the course getting vandalized, Art can actually get a stand-alone lithium battery that can be mounted in various areas. This particular equipment has a SD drive in it. We could put it up for a week at a time to see if we can capture what is happening. Scott said the #5 green area is vandalized the most.
- Golf Professional Report
 - None.
- Men's League Report
 - As Scott mentioned, Men's League begins Start Monday night. The Kickoff Scramble is a week from Sunday. Due dates for entry are Thursday before the Sunday event.
 - Art - did we fill up all nights? Dave stated one night has 17 – the others have 18 teams.
- Ladies League Report
 - None

6. Public comment

- Pete – thanks again to evaluation committee. You all did a terrific job.

7. Next meeting date – May 10, 2016

Mission Statement: The Bill Roberts Golf Course is committed to providing a high quality, friendly, and affordable public golfing experience for all ages and abilities within the greater Helena community!

8. Future agenda items

- ADA Audit Discussion – Review and discuss.

Adjournment

With no further business, Pete adjourned the Golf Advisory Board Meeting at 12:39 pm.

ADA NOTICE

The City of Helena is committed to providing access to persons with disabilities for its meetings, in compliance with Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act and the Montana Human Rights Act. The City will not exclude persons with disabilities from participation at its meetings or otherwise deny them the City's services, programs, or activities.

Persons with disabilities requiring accommodations to participate in the City's meetings, services, programs, or activities should contact the City's ADA Coordinator, Elroy Golemon, as soon as possible to allow sufficient time to arrange for the requested accommodation, at any of the following:

(406) 447- 8490
TTY Relay Service [1-800-253-4091](tel:1-800-253-4091) or 711
citycommunitydevelopment@helenamt.gov
316 North Park, Avenue, Room 440, Helena, MT 59623

Mission Statement: The Bill Roberts Golf Course is committed to providing a high quality, friendly, and affordable public golfing experience for all ages and abilities within the greater Helena community!